TeMA
Journal of Land Use, Mobility and Environment

There are a number of different future-city visions being developed around the world at the moment: one of them is Smart Cities. ICT and big data availability may contribute to better understand and plan the city, improving efficiency, equity and quality of life. But these visions of utopia need an urgent reality check: this is one of the future challenges that Smart Cities have to face.

TeMA is the Journal of Land use, Mobility and Environment and offers papers with a unified approach to planning and mobility. TeMA Journal has also received the Sparc Europe Seal of Open Access Journals released by Scholarly Publishing and Academic Resources Coalition (SPARC Europe) and the Directory of Open Access Journals (DOAJ).

METHODS, TOOLS AND BEST PRACTICES TO INCREASE THE CAPACITY OF URBAN SYSTEMS TO ADAPT TO NATURAL AND MAN-MADE CHANGES
TeMA. Journal of Land Use, Mobility and Environment offers researches, applications and contributions with a unified approach to planning and mobility and publishes original inter-disciplinary papers on the interaction of transport, land use and environment. Domains include: engineering, planning, modeling, behavior, economics, geography, regional science, sociology, architecture and design, network science and complex systems.

The Italian National Agency for the Evaluation of Universities and Research Institutes (ANVUR) classified TeMA as scientific journal in the Area 08. TeMA has also received the 
Sparc Europe Seal for Open Access Journals released by Scholarly Publishing and Academic Resources Coalition (SPARC Europe) and the Directory of Open Access Journals (DOAJ). TeMA is published under a Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 License and is blind peer reviewed at least by two referees selected among high-profile scientists. TeMA has been published since 2007 and is indexed in the main bibliographical databases and it is present in the catalogues of hundreds of academic and research libraries worldwide.

EDITOR IN-CHIEF

Rocco Papa, University of Naples Federico II, Italy

EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD

Mir Ali, University of Illinois, USA
Luca Bertolini, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands
Luuk Boelens, Ghent University, Belgium
Dino Borri, Politecnico University of Bari, Italy
Enrique Calderon, Politecnico University of Madrid, Spain
Roberto Camagni, Politecnico University of Milan, Italy
Derrick De Kerckhove, University of Toronto, Canada
Mark Deakin, Edinburgh Napier University, Scotland
Aharon Kelberman, University of Haifa, Israel
Nicos Komninos, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece
David Matthew Levinson, University of Minnesota, USA
Paolo Malanima, Magna Gracia University of Catanzaro, Italy
Agostino Nuzzolo, Tor Vergata University of Rome, Italy
Rocco Papa, University of Naples Federico II, Italy
Serge Salat, Urban Morphology and Complex Systems Institute, France
Mattheos Santamouris, National Kapodistrian University of Athens, Greece
Ali Soltani, Shiraz University, Iran

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Rosaria Battarra, National Research Council Institute of Studies on Mediterranean Societies, Italy
Luigi dell'Olio, University of Cantabria, Spain
Romano Fistola, University of Sannio, Italy
Carmela Gargiulo, University of Naples Federico II, Italy
Thomas Hartmann, Utrecht University, Netherlands
Markus Hesse, University of Luxemburg, Luxemburg
Seda Kundak, Technical University of Istanbul, Turkey
Rosa Anna La Rocca, University of Naples Federico II, Italy
Houshmand Ebrahimpour Masoumi, Technical University of Berlin, Germany
Giuseppe Mazzeo, National Research Council Institute of Studies on Mediterranean Societies, Italy
Nicola Morelli, Aalborg University, Denmark
Enrica Papa, University of Westminster, United Kingdom
Dorina Pojani, University of Queensland, Australia
Floriana Zucaro, University of Naples Federico II, Italy

EDITORIAL STAFF

Gennaro Angiello, PhD student at University of Naples Federico II, Italy
Gerardo Carpentieri, PhD student at University of Naples Federico II, Italy
Stefano Franco, PhD student at Luiss University Rome, Italy
Marco Raimondo, Engineer, University of Sannio, Italy
Laura Russo, PhD student at University of Naples Federico II, Italy
Maria Rosa Tremiterra, PhD student at University of Naples Federico II, Italy
Andrea Tulisi, PhD at Second University of Naples, Italy
METHODS, TOOLS AND BEST PRACTICES TO INCREASE THE CAPACITY OF URBAN SYSTEMS TO ADAPT TO NATURAL AND MAN-MADE CHANGES
1 (2017)

Contents

3  EDITORIAL PREFACE
Rocco Papa

FOCUS

5  Conurbations and resilience. When growth makes us fragile
Valerio Cutini

25  The water sensitive future of Lahijan. Public spaces as integrated components of stormwater management infrastructure
Masoumeh Mirsafa

LAND USE, MOBILITY AND ENVIRONMENT

41  The effectiveness of urban green spaces and socio-cultural facilities
Mehmet Faruk Altunkasa, Sühü Berberoğlu, Cengiz Uslu, Halil Duymuş

57  Planning assignments of the Italian metropolitan cities. Early trends
Giuseppe Mazzeo

77  Shortcomings to smart city planning and development. Exploring patterns and relationships
Margarita Angelidou
Active transport to school and children's body weight. A systematic review
Houshmand E. Masoumi

REVIEW PAGES
Gennaro Angiello, Gerardo Carpentieri, Maria Rosa Tremiterra, Laura Russo, Andrea Tulisi
ACTIVE TRANSPORT TO SCHOOL AND CHILDREN'S BODY WEIGHT
A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW

HOUSHMAND E. MASOUMI
Center for Technology and Society, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany
e-mail: masoumi@tu-berlin.de

ABSTRACT

Because of decreasing physical activity of children, they are becoming more obese. Moreover, commuting to school has become more passive during the past decades. The objective was to update the previous systematic reviews by narrowing down the topic to body mass index of children (3-12 years) as a representative of body composition. Applying search terms such as active transport to school, body mass index, childhood obesity, and so on in four online databases: PubMed, ScienceDirect, WorldCat, and Google Scholar. Peer-reviewed English journal papers published between 2005 and 2015 presenting empirical quantitative studies were eligible studies to be reviewed. 310 journal papers were screened, 27 of which were reviewed by studying the full text. The final 13 papers were limited to those that focused only on active commuting to school and body mass index of children and adolescents. Out of 13 final studies, 3 found conclusive associations, three indicate partial associations in subgroups or societal or geographical limitations, and seven show no correlations. The existing literature are still inconsistent, so this study suggests conducting surveys with larger samples on less-studied contexts and applying more complex statistical methods for adjusting some of the variables. It is also argued that this topic can be culturally and contextually specific.

KEYWORDS:
Active transport to school, body mass index, childhood obesity, overweight, children.
How to cite item in APA format:

摘 要

由于儿童的身体运动量在不断减少，他们也因此而变得越来越肥胖。而且，在过去的几十年里，被动方式的学校通勤已成为一种常态。本文的目的是为了通过评述反映儿童（3-12岁）身体结构的体重指数来更新以前的系统评价。在以下四个在线数据库中使用主动学校通勤、体重指数、儿童肥胖等搜索术语：PubMed、ScienceDirect、WorldCat和Google Scholar。2005和2016年间发表的同行评审英文期刊论文对定量研究进行了介绍，符合审查资格。对310篇期刊论文进行了筛选，并对其中27篇进行了通稿研究审查。最后的13篇论文仅限于那些只关注主动学校通勤以及儿童和青少年的体重指数的研究。在最后13项研究中，有3项研究发现了存在明确的联系，3项研究表示在群体或社会或地域限制方面存在部分联系，而另外7项研究没有联系。现有的文献仍然存在不一致，因此本研究建议对大量较少研究的情况进行调查，并应用更复杂的统计方法来调整一些变量。也可以针对具体的文化和内容来开展这类研究。

关键词:
主动学校通勤, 体重指数, 儿童肥胖, 超重, 儿童
1 INTRODUCTION

With continuous increase in body weight of the youth in several regions of the world, researchers and practitioners have recently sought for passive ways for prevention of obesity as a driver of a handful of diseases. The Active Transport to School (ATS) - Body Mass Index (BMI) studies as a part of research on ATS and children’s body composition has been noted to be inconsistent in a couple of studies (Ford et al. 2007; Landsberg et al. 2008; Pabayo et al. 2010; Mendoza et al. 2011; Drake et al. 2012; Saksvig et al. 2012; Heelan et al. 2013). The objective of this study is to update our knowledge using the most up-to-date observations conducted recently and to check if the knowledge produced by the scholars of this topic has become consistent. It is meant to refer to a similar study done by Lubans et al. and update their work after six years, though that study targeted both children and adolescents and also investigated not only BMI but a broader range of health-related fitness. Although this review attempts to complete the previous ones, it is new because it narrows down childhood age and only to BMI as a body composition measure.

Respecting the fast-growing field of children’s active commuting and their body weight, it would be appealing to test the inclusiveness of the results of the recent empirical studies. After six year of the previous systematic study, it would be relevant to update the feedback using the new quantitative investigations. The field is very much progressive, so it is logical to refresh the systematic reviews occasionally by means of the results of several research groups actively publishing their findings. The studies related to active transportation to school and the effects on children’s body weight is currently being developed in several developing countries, thus the new findings may show contextual disparities.

Apart from the clear connections of the research theme to urban transportation planning and urban land use, there are direct connection between the subject and infrastructure planning and indirect but considerable associations with urban environment. The more sustainable transport modes children and their parents take for school commuting, the cleaner will the urban environment be; there are less air and sound pollution. The infrastructure side will be related to development of the sidewalks, bike routes and tracks, infrastructure customized for safety of children, safer and secure playgrounds, customized routes from populated areas to school, and the like. In addition to the benefits for the public health of the society, increasing suitability of the urban environment for walking and biking of children to school can lead to other outcomes in mobility and environment; our understanding about the relationship between the behavior of children and their parents show that changing the travel behavior of children can be associated in change in their parents' travels. Hence, undertaking fundamental research on the commute trips of children can help providing more sustainable mobility for several age groups. These interrelations between sub-topics form a multifaceted subject resulting in healthier, safer, and more livable urban environment for children and their parents.

For such an updating, systematic review without meta-analysis is applied in this paper. Few systematic reviews have been done on the theme of this paper for children and adolescents. Systematic review is considered to be suitable for concluding the results of quantitative studies during the past years since they "Systematic reviews are not only instrumental for implementing evidence-based practice but also for taking stock relative to a particular question (or set of questions) and for the shaping of future research. For development, the primary role of systematic reviews rests with the creation of data-based rationales for newly proposed development activities.” (Schlosser, 2006).

2 BACKGROUND

Urban planning has gained importance in promoting public health during the past years (Hoehner et al. 2003). Built environment has been recently addressed by scholars as a determinant of public health (Frumkin, 2003; Jackson, 2003). The role of planners in enhancing public health has been highlighted in academic research.
Urban planning efforts such as interventions in form of community design, housing development, community organizing, greenspace planning, etc. are applied as Active Living by Design provide environments that support active living of residents (i.e. Miller & Scofield, 2009). During the past years, scholars have tried to draw attentions to the potentials of public policy approaches to urban transportation and land development to provide better conditions of public health (Frank & Engelke, 2001). Certain approaches to urban planning or the related shortcomings may be considered as sustainable forms suitable for promotion of public health, while others may be a named as unhealthy urban development, i.e. urban sprawl is considered as unhealthy by some researchers: “among those with chronic conditions, including hypertension, diabetes, and lung disease, those who live in areas with more highly connected street networks have higher rated health.” (Kelly-Schwartz, 2004).

The existing literature depicts a holistic image of the influences of the physical environment on physical activity (PA) as an important aspect of public health (Sallis et al. 2006; Aytur et al. 2008; Timmermans et al. 2016). Sustainable urban form is associated with forms of PA, when urban planning targets the concept of smart growth principles including housing opportunities, walkable neighborhoods, community and stakeholder collaborations, attractive communities with sense of place, mixed land use, diverse transport mode choices, preserved open spaces, etc.

The role of physical activity in obesity and overweight of children (Goran et al. 1999; Steinbeck, 2001; Hills, et al. 2012; Corder et al. 2016). The linkage between the physical environment and physical activity is built by active transportation, bicycling, and particularly walking as elements of sustainable urban transportation planning (Craig et al. 2002, Handy et al. 2002; van Dyck et al. 2010a &; van Holle et al. 2014). Walkability is not the only essence of urban form that can increase PA; some other qualities such as regional accessibility, sidewalks, bike facilities and recreation facility access are also associated with physical activity and condludingly body weight and high blood pressure (Ulmer et al. 2014). This correlation may affect body weight of all age groups (Smith et al. 2008). Neighborhood walkability can be decisive for children’s PA (D’Haese et al. 2014). Walkability of the local space around residential places as well as the way to school can be of importance regarding physical activity of the youth. Researchers have majorly suggested to adopt policy to make the surrounding of schools more walkable. The examples are providing safer environment for children to promote their walking to and from school (Shbeeb & Awad, 2013) and selection of school site according to street connectivity (Giles-Corti et al. 2011). In general, 14 different interventions were identified by Chillón et al. (2011) for promotion of active commuting to school in the United States, the United Kingdom, and Australia. The physical activity of children has decreased compared to previous decades (Tanter & Doyle, 1996; Karsten, 2005; Hillman, 2006). The reasons can lay in very different aspects of modern life such as built environment, lifestyles, socio-economics, objective and subjective safety and security, etc. Outdoor physical activities and organized sport practice of US children has been significantly reduced between 1981 and 1997 4. Lack of PA in children may come together with hypertension, insulin resistance, dyslipidemia, cardiometabolic risk, and finally obesity (Ekelund et al. 2006; Ness et al. 2007; Leary et al. 2008; Owen et al. 2010).

The literature attempting to analyze the circumstances of diminishing PA of children and its correlates are have discussed many aspects including the urban form and neighborhood, socio-economics and social interactions, safety, and security. In many cases, the results of the empirical studies are consistent and reliable. A newer topic that has drawn attention of scholars is the concept of ATS. During the past decades, children’s walking and biking to and from school has been weakened. Children are chauffeured to school much more than previous decades in several countries (Department of Transport, 2001, 2009; Sturm, 2004; Karsten, 2005; Salmon et al. 2005; McDonald, 2007; van der Ploeg et al. 2008; Garrard, 2011). There is also evidence that childhood outdoor PA is decreasing (e.g. Sturm, 2004; McDonald et al. 2009) and their body weight is continuously increasing in several countries. The findings related to this topic clearly describe the advantages
of ATS and its contributions to PA. Nevertheless, when it comes to the associations of ATS with children’s body weight, obesity, and BMI, the study results are not clear.

3 METHODOLOGY

The present paper presents a systematic review of literature dealing with ATS, BMI, and their associations. The objective is to clarify if the inconsistency in the results addressed in a couple of studies mentioned above still exists. The question that is to be answered by this study is are there significant associations between ATS and children’s BMI? This study focuses only on children and avoids to broaden the age to adolescents; the age criterion of this study is thus limited to 3 to 12 years. It is clear that three to six-year old children do not go to school, but in this paper, ATS refers to a wider meaning than only attending elementary school. Here, both elementary school and kindergarten are addressed. The topic is studied in an international context using all the literature from high-income and emerging economies.

ATS and similar terms as well as BMI, “body weight”, and obesity were searched for online. Nine different combinations were searched for as illustrated in Table 1. English peer-reviewed journal papers were searched and the results were arranged in Citavi citation management software. Location of published papers played no role in the search. As a result, 310 citations were collected.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHILDREN’S MOBILITY PATTERNS</th>
<th>WEIGHT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Active Transport to School</td>
<td>BMI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active Commuting to School</td>
<td>Body Weight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active School Transportation</td>
<td>Obesity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab. 1 Search Parameters

Searches in four databases (PubMed, ScienceDirect, WorldCat, and Google Scholar) identified 310 citations published in 2005 and later. Fig. 1 depicts the inclusion/exclusion procedure.

The criteria employed for quality assessment of the final bibliography based on an adaptation of Strengthening the Reporting of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (STROBE) statement, which is also taken by Lubans et al. (2011). The six assessment criteria of Elm et al. were slightly changed to fit within the topic of this study. For making this study consistent with that of Lubans et al. (2011), the three common studies are assessed according to Lubans et al. These three studies are Heelan et al. (2005), Rosenberg et al. (2006), and Owen et al. (2010).

4 RESULTS

The number of studies on the target topic conducted in the recent years is increasing; four studies have been published in 2015. Nine studies (less than 70 percent) were published between 2010 and 2015, while between 2005 and 2010 only four were out. Five out of 13 studies (38.5%) were conducted in the US. Two studies (15.4%) were done in Canada. Australia, Norway, Sweden, Spain, and China had each one, and one study was international (Table 3). Four studies are longitudinal (Rosenberg et al. 2006; Pabayo et al. 2010; Chillón et al. 2012; Mendoza et al. 2014), which provides a higher quality in discussing causation than the existing evidence back in 2011 by Lubans et al. (2 out of 27 which equals 7.4%). Except Fulton et al. (2005) and DeWees & Ohri-Vachaspati (2015), who applied random-digit dial survey, others took self-reported questionnaires for collecting ATS and other data. Body composition data were measured by research staff, or by other equipment, or were self-reported. Sample sizes differ from 262 in Sweden (Chillón et al. 2012) to 21596 in China (Sun et al. 2015). Samples of one thousand or more have mostly been taken between 2013
and 2015. The widest age range has been 3-18 years (DeWees & Ohri-Vachaspati, 2015), while the narrowest ranges was 10.2 ± 0.7 years (Heelan et al. 2005). All 13 studies examined both sexes. Walking and biking were the essential modes of ATS of the selected studies. Only Yeung et al. (2008) did not observe bicycle trips. ATS ranged from 8.67% (Mendoza et al. 2014) to 69% (Gutiérrez-Zornoza et al. 2015) within the children of the samples, both conducted in the US.

As illustrated in Table 2, six out of 13 studies (46.2%) scored ≥ 4, which is almost comparable with the quality of 27 studies analyzed in 2011 (Lubans et al.). Only five studies succeeded to provide convincing information concerning random selection of participants/schools (Fulton et al. 2005; Pabayo et al. 2010; Østergaard et al. 2013; Gutierrez-Zornoza et al. 2015; DeWeese and Ohri-Vachaspati, 2015). Reporting the sources and details of BMI was the strength of 10 studies. Most of the studies failed to fulfill the requirement of the last question regarding the number of respondents who completed each of the different measures, and if they succeeded to do so, they did not catch the 80% threshold.
Out of 13 studies, three conclusively confirmed existence of associations between ATS and BMI (Larouche et al. 2011; Sarmiento et al. 2015; Sun et al. 2015), three partially confirm such associations in certain conditions (Rosenberg et al. 2006; Mendoza et al. 2014; DeWeese and Ohri-Vachaspati, 2015), and seven reject any association (Fulton et al. 2005; Heelan et al. 2005; Yeung et al. 2008; Pabayo et al. 2010; Chillón et al. 2012; Østergaard et al. 2013; Gutiérrez-Zornoza et al. 2015). The example of the studies that found associations in specific conditions is Rosenberg et al. (2006) that found significant associations only for boys. The significant associations found by Mendoza et al. (2014) were limited to less safe neighborhoods. Finally, DeWees & Ohri-Vachaspati, (2015) reported inverse associations only for children who walk, bike, or skateboard to school beyond half a mile. The average sample size of the three conclusively confirming studies is 9569, while those of the three studies that found associations in subgroups and some of the measures and seven studies finding no correlations are 4784 and 2769 respectively (Table 3). Table 3 also depicts that more recent studies have found associations more than older ones; three fourth of studies published in 2015 found general or partial relations, four studies out of five conducted between 2005 and 2010 did not report any associations. Except Larouche et al. who found an association from a sample of 315 students, all the other five studies that reported correlations were based on larger samples of around one thousand students or more. Two out of three studies that reported general correlations (Sarmiento et al. 2015; Sun et al. 2015) were done in less-studied contexts or internationally. Both cross-sectional and longitudinal studies found correlations. Except Larouche et al. that did not report clearly about the modes of active transport to school in their study, only Yeung et al. (2008) took a one-mode ATS (walking). This only study found no relations with BMI.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STUDIES</th>
<th>(I)</th>
<th>(II)</th>
<th>(III)</th>
<th>(IV)</th>
<th>(V)</th>
<th>(VI)</th>
<th>QUALITY SCORE TOTAL/6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DeWees &amp; Ohri-Vachaspati, (2015)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun et al. (2015)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarmiento et al. (2015)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gutiérrez-Zornoza et al. (2015)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mendoza et al. (2014)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Østergaard et al. (2013)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chillón et al. (2012)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Larouche et al. (2011)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pabayo et al. (2010)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yeung et al. (2008)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rosenberg et al. (2006)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heelan et al. (2005)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fulton et al. (2005)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab. 2 Assessment of study quality

(I) Did the study describe the participant eligibility criteria?
(II) Were the study schools/ participants randomly selected (or representative of the study population)?
(III) Did the study report the sources and details of ATS measurement and did the methods have acceptable reliability for the specific age group?
(IV) Did the study report the sources and details of body weight assessment and did the all of the methods have acceptable reliability for the specific age group?
(V) Did the study report a power calculation and was the study adequately powered to detect hypothesized relationships?
(VI) Did the study report the numbers of individuals who completed each of the different measures and did participants complete at least 80% of measure
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author, Location and Time</th>
<th>Study Design / Analysis Method</th>
<th>Data Collection Method</th>
<th>Sample Size</th>
<th>Participants' Age and Sex</th>
<th>ATS Type</th>
<th>Percent of Children Classified as Active Commuters</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DeWees &amp; Ohri-Vachaspati, 2015</td>
<td>Cross-sectional, T-Test and Chi-square tests with some demographic, food consumption and PA variables as covariates.</td>
<td>Random digit-dial household survey: An adult in the household (often parents) talked on phone and did the measurements.</td>
<td>1408 households: 1 randomly selected school-going student per household</td>
<td>3-18 / Both</td>
<td>walking, biking, or skateboarding</td>
<td>47.2%</td>
<td>Without fixing distance, no association were reported. Inverse associations between ATS and overweight/obesity were found among students who commute beyond half a mile.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun et al. 2015</td>
<td>Cross-sectional, multivariate linear regression</td>
<td>Questionnaires administered by research staff in classrooms.</td>
<td>21596 children and adolescents (9445 boys and 12151 girls), 21280 of whom had BMI information.</td>
<td>Students of grade 1 to 12 / Both</td>
<td>Walking, biking</td>
<td>Not reported</td>
<td>ATS is associated with lower body weight represented by BMI, percentage of body fat, and waist circumference. Children who walked to school were significantly less likely to be obese.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarmiento et al. 2015</td>
<td>Cross-sectional / linear mixed model</td>
<td>Questionnaires. Measurements were done by staff.</td>
<td>6797 children</td>
<td>Students of age 9 to 11 years / Both</td>
<td>walking, biking, roller blades and scooter</td>
<td>37.2% walking and 4.9% bicycling, roller-blade, skateboard, scooter</td>
<td>ATS is associated with lower BMI.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gutiérrez-Zornoza et al. 2015</td>
<td>Cross-sectional / T-Test and Pearson's Chi-square test</td>
<td>Cluster randomized trial</td>
<td>956 participants (472 boys and 484 girls), who join 18 public schools in rural areas.</td>
<td>Students of age 10 to 12 in Grades 5 and 6 / Both</td>
<td>Walking, biking</td>
<td>69% (boys: 68.4%, girls: 69.5%)</td>
<td>No associations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Time Period</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>Sample Size</td>
<td>Transportation Methods</td>
<td>BMI Measurement</td>
<td>Findings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mendoza et al. 2014</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>1998-2004</td>
<td>Longitudinal / ANCOVA</td>
<td>12022</td>
<td>Walking, biking</td>
<td>Both</td>
<td>Children of age 9-15 from 40 elementary schools and 23 high schools had lower fifth grade BMI z-scores than their peers who did not do ACS, and there was no difference in fifth grade BMI z-scores among children from more-safe neighborhoods.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Østergaard et al. 2013</td>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>2005-2006</td>
<td>Cross-sectional / multiple linear regression</td>
<td>2299</td>
<td>Walking, biking</td>
<td>Both</td>
<td>No association were found between transport to school and BMI after adjusting for age, gender and leisure time physical activity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chillón et al. 2012</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>1998-2005</td>
<td>Longitudinal / ANCOVA</td>
<td>262</td>
<td>Walking, biking</td>
<td>Both</td>
<td>No associations were found between ATS and fatness (BMI, waist circumference, and sum of 5 skinfolds).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Larouche et al. 2011</td>
<td>Eastern Ontario, Canada</td>
<td>2009-2010</td>
<td>Cross-sectional / T-Test, ANCOVA</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>Not reported.</td>
<td>Both</td>
<td>Children who use ATS had lower BMI values, and were less likely to be overweight and obese.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pabayo et al. 2010</td>
<td>Quebec, Canada</td>
<td>1997-1998</td>
<td>Longitudinal / growth curve analyses was applied to examine the relationship between sustained ATS and BMI Z-scores.</td>
<td>1170</td>
<td>Walking, biking</td>
<td>Both</td>
<td>No association was found between ATS and being overweight (between 75% and 85% percentiles) or obese (&gt;95% percentile).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Design</td>
<td>Data Collection</td>
<td>Sample Size</td>
<td>Age Range</td>
<td>Mode</td>
<td>Active commuting to school and BMI change/overweight status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yeung et al. 2008</td>
<td>Brisbane, Australia</td>
<td>Cross-sectional</td>
<td>Self-administered parental questionnaire</td>
<td>318 participants (46.9% boys and 53.1% girls)</td>
<td>4-12 / Both</td>
<td>Walking</td>
<td>33.6% No association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rosenberg et al. 2006</td>
<td>Southern California, USA</td>
<td>Longitudinal</td>
<td>Supervised questionnaire in the classroom, Caltrac accelerometers</td>
<td>924 participants in 5th grade at the end of the study period (53.2% boys; 46.8% girls)</td>
<td>4th and 5th grade students in 7 suburban elementary schools / Both</td>
<td>Walking, biking, skateboarding</td>
<td>20% Boys who actively commuted to school had lower BMI (p &lt; 0.01). No such association was found for girls. Active commuting to school over 2 years was not associated with BMI change or overweight status.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heelan et al. 2005</td>
<td>Nebraska, USA</td>
<td>Cross-sectional</td>
<td>Questionnaires sent to children’s houses. Research staff did the measurements in schools using Seca Platform Scale, model 707.</td>
<td>320 participants (44% boys and 56% girls) in 8 rural schools</td>
<td>Age 10.2 ± 0.7 years / Both</td>
<td>Walking, biking, skateboarding / scooter</td>
<td>36% of the children who lived between 0.8 and 1.6 km from their school actively commuted at least 50% of the time. 9% actively commuted more than 75% of the time each week. Significant positive associations were found between active commuting to school index (number of active commutes by distance to school) and BMI. No results were reported indicating ability of ATS in attenuating BMI.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fulton et al. 2005</td>
<td>USA / 1996</td>
<td>Cross-sectional</td>
<td>Random digit-dial household survey, Computer-assisted telephone interviews</td>
<td>1458 parent-child pairs</td>
<td>Students of grades 4 to 12 / Both</td>
<td>Walking, biking</td>
<td>Walk: 11.4%, bike: 2.6% No associations: compared to obese/overweight participants, those with normal BMI have 0.8 (0.5-1.1) times the odds of using ATS.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab. 3 Review results
DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

The results of this systematic review shows that after an increase in the number of studies on ATS and BMI of children, the results are still not consistent. No conclusive result is thus to be derived from the studies published after 2005. However, the partial conclusion can be active transport to school may lead to lower BMIs in children, particularly for longer walking/cycling distances, for boys, and in less safe neighborhoods. Despite conduction of several interesting studies during the past five years, the finding of this review is still in line with five older systematic reviews that did not find the international findings consistent and compelling (Lee et al. 2008; Faulkner et al. 2009; Lubans et al. 2011; Schoeppe et al. 2013; Larouche et al. 2014).

It is noteworthy that this study has been narrowed down to only children and BMI in hope of better quality of research, while most of the abovementioned systematic reviews have much wider topics; i.e. the associations of ATS with children’s PA and weight (Lee et al. 2008; Schoeppe et al. 2013), the same associations in children and the youth (Faulkner et al. 2009), ATS with health-related fitness in children (Lubans et al. 2011), and finally ATS with PA, body composition, and cardiovascular fitness in children and adolescents (Larouche et al. 2014). For undertaking this study, it is assumed that narrowing down the effective factors of the associations as well as the age limit may promote the quality of the review.

Based on the results of this review, more studies are needed to clarify the possible associations. Two points are necessary to be cared about in the future research: (1) larger sample sizes; (2) less-studied contexts. The results of this review reveals that most of studies that found significant correlations were carried out enjoying at least one of the above conditions.

The findings of this study confirms the comment of Bere and Anderson (2009) who believe higher sample sizes may provide higher statistical power for finding associations of ATS and BMI. The literature studied in this paper suggest that in case seeking universal and conclusive associations may fail, investigating subgroups, geographical and contextual settings, or different socio-economics can lead to identifying relationships, e.g. some studies address the ATS-BMI relationship stronger in boys, or the associations may be stronger for cycling rather than walking. More complex statistical methods for controlling for some of the variables may help identify relative relationships.

Two recent studies published in 2015 focused on less-studied contexts like China (Sun et al. 2015) and an international group of countries mostly among emerging economies (Sarmiento et al. 2015) found conclusive correlations. This suggests that if the future studies are directed towards these regions, a better understanding of different ATS-BMI relationships are provided and more significant outputs maybe resulted. This idea is supported by limited number of a recent research that show the correlated of ATS may be context-specific (Larouche et al. 2015) and that in a multi-ethnic society like England, the ATS habits are different among ethnicities: “white European children were more likely to walk/cycle, black African Caribbeans to travel by public transport and South Asian children to travel by car” (Owen et al. 2012). If ATS behaviors are different inside a single country, then it can be hypothesized that habits like the speed and intensity of walking or biking to school may be various in different geographies and cultures. This may cause changes on the effectiveness of ATS on children’s body weight. While in some cultures children may have interest to walk or bike faster than some other contexts, PA may be affected differently, and consequently BMI may be attenuated in a higher level. We have very little evidence about the culturally and contextually specificity of ATS-BMI correlations. Thus, this topic deserves more observations and analyses.

To sum up, this systematic review of recent literature indicates inconsistency in ATS-BMI relationship research results. Further research by means of larger samples in less-studied contexts and cultures may be useful for shaping the overall structure of the subject.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study has been conducted as a part of the project "Multisport Against Physical Sedentary"-M.A.P.S. (project number 567236-EPP-1-2015-2-IT-SPO-SCP) funded by the ERASMUS+ program of the European Commission.

REFERENCES


DeWeese, R., & Ohri-Vachaspati, P. (2015), "The Role of Distance in Examining the Association Between Active Commuting to School and Students' Weight Status", Journal of Physical Activity and Health 12(9), 1280–1288. doi:10.1123/jpah.2014-0100


Karsten, L. (2005), "It all used to be better?: Different generations on continuity and change in urban children's daily use of space", *Children's Geographies* 3(3), 275–290. doi:10.1080/14733280500352912


IMAGE SOURCES

Cover photo: Image Credit: Hernán Piñera on Flickr (Creative Commons License).

AUTHOR’S PROFILE

Houshmand E. Masoumi is senior researcher in Center for Technology and Society, Technical University of Berlin, where he did a postdoc research on the interactions of land use and urban travel behavior in Iranian cities. He holds PhD in urban planning and development from Technical University of Dortmund. His research interests include the effects of urban transformations on travel behavior, walkable neighborhoods, traditional urban form, sustainable transportation, and urban sprawl.